



### MINUTES OF 18<sup>th</sup> MEETING OF NATIONAL AGRICULTURE EDUCATION ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

# MARCH 25, 2022

The 18<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was held on **March 25, 2022 at 9:30 am in the Mural Hall of Higher Education Commission** (**HEC**), **H-9, Islamabad**. Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq A. Rajwana, Chairperson NAEAC, chaired the meeting attended by 20 members (Annexure-I).

2. The meeting commenced with recitation from the Holy Quran. Chairperson appreciated the honorable members for sparing precious time and warmly welcomed all members. He paid special tributes for members who participated in person observing Covid-19 SOPs. NAEAC Annual Report 2020-21 was shared among the members present physically and displayed for online members. In opening remarks the chair presented the achievements of NAEAC since 2008. The chair informed that number of subjects under NAEAC purview have increased from sixteen to twenty four disciplines related to agriculture and allied sciences degree programs. Till date accreditation of 428 degree programs have been conducted, 14 Annual reports have been published and 86 awareness seminars were carried out. There are activities which takes place on yearly basis while certain activities like training of evaluators occur once in a 3-4 years duration. NAEAC has planned training of evaluators in June 2022. In this regard necessary preparatory steps have already been initiated involving QAA, HEC.

3. The Chairperson highlighted different challenges faced by the Council which include long term financial sustainability and briefed about plans to overcome constraints. Administrative reluctance in implementing quality education by university administration, mushroom growth of agriculture and allied sciences in various HEIs, initiation of new degree programs without having proper faculty, infrastructure, poor teacher student ratio and improper functioning of QECs and ORICs in some HEIs is another concern to be discussed at higher forums for the improvement of graduates. In HEC latest new undergraduate policy, credit hours for professional degree program have been reduced causing challenges for professional degrees like agriculture and allied sciences. The council members emphasized that there must be a distinction between the credit hours of professional and non-professional degree programs. The credit hours for professional degree programs must be enhanced instead of equating to general degree programs.

4. Chairperson also expressed his concern for employing under paid PhD faculty by some HEIs, together with lack of industrial training, non-availability of lab manuals and teaching of technical subjects by irrelevant faculty. Chairperson also tinted the responsibility of NAEAC to publish a parent/student alert of non-responsive HEIs in public and private sector.

5. NAEAC Council Board in its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting held on September 30, 2019 directed the council to develop a software for registration of agriculture graduates, professional and fellows, consequently Agriculture Personnel Registration System (APRS) was developed and

Anaffar 20/7/2022

inaugurated in 16<sup>th</sup> council meeting held on December 28, 2020. However the response from large universities is not encouraging compared to smaller HEIs.

6. He emphasized that accreditation data over a period of 14 years exhibits an improvement in all rating category (W, X, Y and Z), however, a general feeling of deterioration in quality of graduates produced over the period of time is being complained by the recruiting agencies like Public Service Commission and private companies, etc.

In this context chairperson raised the following questions:

- i) Do the standards set by NAEAC have become obsolete in gauging quality of degree programs?
- ii) Do the standards miss some important aspects related to the production of quality graduate like professional skills/practicals trainings/emphasis in field work in teaching, etc.?
- iii) Do the evaluators have become lenient while accrediting the degree programs?
- iv) Do NAEAC need to add and/or delete some standards from toolkits?
- v) Do NAEAC need to increase evaluators capacity by incorporating training?
- vi) Do NAEAC need more support from HEC to prevail and implement program evaluators decisions?

7. While responding the questions raised by the Chairperson, the honorable members suggested that curriculum should be revised as per industrial needs with enhanced professional courses and dedicated but paid internship. In addition to this it was agreed to review the current toolkit of NAEAC and for that purpose Chairperson was authorized by the Council Board to manage the toolkit revision by organizing a relevant committee.

8. After the introductory remarks by the Chair and introduction of all members, Secretary, NAEAC presented item-wise agenda of meeting for consideration and approval. A summary of decisions taken in the meeting is given below:

# Agenda Item#1: Confirmation of Minutes of 17th Council Meeting

9. Minutes of 17<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Council presented for confirmation of the council members.

**Decision:** In absence of any note by honorable members minutes of the 17<sup>th</sup> Council Meeting were unanimously approved as presented.

# Agenda Item#2: Implementation Status of Last Council Meeting and Action Taken

10. Secretary NAEAC presented implementation status of last council meeting and status of action taken for the information of council members.

Achaffar 20/7/2022

# <u>Agenda Item No. 3:</u> Consideration/Approval for Creation of Endowment fund for Investment

11. In 17<sup>th</sup> council meeting held on August 23, 2021 in Higher Education Commission (HEC) H-9, Islamabad, it was suggested by honorable members to develop an endowment fund of NAEAC for future sustainability of the council. From the last 10 years, Council is receiving Rs.4.00 million/ year from Higher Education Commission (HEC) Islamabad vide letter No. QAA/Council/HEC/2012/93 dated 14-16-2012 for its financial sustainability and current FY 2021-22 is the last year. Accordingly council has planned to improve its financial health on sustainable basis by expanding activities including addition of new disciplines, increasing accreditation fee, registration of agriculture graduates and reducing the cost of accreditation by adopting paperless accreditation through a software developed indigenously. However creation of endowment fund for saved money will be the key to keep council financially healthy, accordingly finance office of NAEAC prepared a framework to create endowment fund for investment.

12. There are two types of banks for placement of funds, conventional banks and Islamic banks. In conventional banks, fixed rate of interest is being given to investor and in Islamic bank, ownership remains with bank and reward bear by the bank as owner of assets. So for the placement of funds, some quotations were called from AAA rated banks under Pakistan Credit Rating Agency (PACRA) updated credit rating of banks as of July 12, 2021. Call for quotations send to six financial institutions viz a viz Allied Bank Limited, United Bank Limited, Muslim Commercial Bank Limited, National Bank of Pakistan, Habib Bank Limited and Al-Meezan Investment Bank Limited. Within a given time two quotations were received, one from United Bank Limited and second from Al-Meezan Investment Management Limited. Al-Meezan Investments rate is competitive due to High Returns, daily profit calculation, compounding effect and no charges on premature withdrawal.

**Decision:** Honorable council members agreed in principle to establish an endowment fund as earlier, however, asked the council secretariat to get opinion of finance division and law division of HEC whether a delegators body can establish endowment fund and then put the case in next council board meeting for final approval.

## Agenda Item No. 4: Consideration/Approval for Enhancement of NAEAC Contractual Employees Salary Package

13. The chairperson apprised honorable members that contractual employees joined the NAEAC secretariat in the month of September, 2020. All NAEAC contractual employees have requested for enhancement of salary package based upon inflation. In pursuance of the decision of NAEAC taken in its 17<sup>th</sup> Council meeting agenda item 13, held on August 23, 2021, Ad-Hoc Relief Allowance- 2021 @ 10% of basic pay has been approved by the honorable members and granted to NAEAC employees with effect from 1st July, 2021. Following is the details of

Achaffar 20/7/2022

Sr. No.	Name and Designation	Previous Pay Rs.	Existing Pay Rs.
1	Dr. Abdul Ghaffar Secretary (BPS-19)	85,000	90,921
2	Mr. Kausar Saeed Awan Deputy Director Coordination (BPS-18)	65,000	68,835
3	Mr. Malik Arshad Assistant Director Admin & Finance (BPS-17)	50,000	53,037
4	Mr. Muhammad Faraz Afzal Assistant Director Coordination (BPS-17)	45,000	48,037
5	Mr. Zafar Ali Software Engineer/Web Developer (BPS-16)	40,000	41,891
6	Mr. Muhammad Shafqat Office Attendant/Dispatch Rider (BPS-5)	25,000	26,026

contractual employees salary package after granting 10% of basic pay Ad-Hoc Relief Allowance- 2021:

14. In view of the above, existing pay package is less compared to market competitive salary even after increasing 10% of basic pay Ad-Hoc Relief Allowance-2021. The inflation rate, dollar exchange rate and high prices of daily routine food items compelled the NAEAC employees to request NAEAC Board to consider a suitable increase in pay package.

# Decision: The honorable members authorized the chairperson to develop basic pay scale wise model with annual increment. The Chairperson made the following slabs for each contractual employee to be effective from July each year. However, for new employees at least one year service would be essential for the grant of annual increment.

Sr. No.	Name and Designation	Existing Pay Rs.	Annual Increment	Total Pay Rs.
1	Dr. Abdul Ghaffar Secretary (BPS-19)	90,921	14,000	104,921
2	Mr. Kausar Saeed Awan Deputy Director Coordination (BPS-18)	68,835	10,000	78,835
3	Mr. Malik Arshad Assistant Director Admin & Finance (BPS-17)	53,037	10,000	63,037
4	Mr. Muhammad Faraz Afzal Assistant Director Coordination (BPS- 17)	48,037	10,000	58,037
5	Mr. Zafar Ali Software Engineer/Web Developer (BPS-16)	41,891	8,000	49,891
6	Mr. Muhammad Shafqat Office Attendant/Dispatch Rider (BPS-5)	26,026	5,000	31,026

Achaffar 20/7/2022

# <u>Agenda Item No. 5:</u> Inauguration of Agriculture Accreditation Automation System of NAEAC

15. Chairperson apprised the honorable members regarding the development of Agriculture Accreditation Automation System (AAAS) where accreditation related activities will be managed efficiently in an environment friendly manners.

**Decision:** With the permission of all honorable members Mr. Zafar Ali (Software Engineer) inaugurated this system by pushing the button prepared for this purpose.

# <u>Agenda Item No. 6:</u> Follow-up Mechanism for Ensuring Actions against Actionable Recommendations

16. Secretary briefed the need of follow up to ensure that AIC actionable recommendations are considered by host institution more seriously, a follow up proforma is developed as below:

#### Proforma for follow-up of action taken against actionable recommendations

- 1) Name of HEI
- 2) Name of Faculty
- 3) Name of Department/Institute
- 4) Degree Program
- 5) Date of Visit
- 6) Program Evaluator Name
- 7) Type of visit

#### Summary of recommendations and action taken

<u>S. No.</u>	AIC Actionable Recommendations	Action Taken by Host Institution
1		
2		
3		

**Decision:** *After a thorough discussion above proforma was approved for communicating with host institutions at least twice a year* 

# Agenda Item No. 7: Uniform Nomenclature of Undergraduate/Postgraduate Degree Programs in Agriculture and Allied Disciplines

17. Issue of uniform nomenclature of undergraduate agriculture and allied degree programs was discussed earlier in 16<sup>th</sup> council meeting under agenda item no.18 for which Chairperson informed that B.Sc. (Hons.) degree is already equated to BS by HEC. Later, Quality Assurance Division suggested NAEAC to get opinion of honorable members on adoption of international

Ahaffar 20/7/2022

uniform nomenclature as BS instead of B.Sc. (Hons.) agriculture. This will help uniformity in professional as well as general education.

18. The honorable members pointed out that all service rules and service structure has embedded with basic degree of BSc (Hons) agriculture so if we change it to BS it will need either to revise all service rules of all provinces or HEC again has to issue an equivalence certificate.

**Decision:** BSc (Hons.) nomenclature should be continued to avoid any problems in hiring of Agriculture & Allied disciplines graduates.

## Agenda Item No. 8: Revival of NCRC by HEC

19. HEC has revived the activities of NCRC during current fiscal year. NAEAC also requested Advisor (Academics & Accreditation) for developing/reviewing curriculum of six new subjects in the purview of NAEAC. Advisor (Academics& Accreditation) assured the members that during the current fiscal year the curriculum will be revised of 6 new requested subjects.

**Decision:** Honorable members thanked the Advisor (Academics& Accreditation) for full support to develop unified curriculum of the new subjects.

# Agenda Item No. 9: Request from HND Experts of different HEIs regarding Suggestion for Accreditation of Human Nutrition and Dietetics Degree Programs

20. On behalf of HoDs/Chairpersons of HND related departments of different HEIs, Prof. Dr. Rubina Hakeem, Chief Nutritionist, Chairperson Nutrition Foundation of Pakistan and Head of Human Nutrition and Dietetics Department, Ziauddin University, Karachi has requested that in view of the public safety, before undertaking any accreditation activity, I would request the HEC authorities to kindly consider the following :

- Distinguish between professional and nonprofessional programs in human nutrition and dietetics.
- Consider graduates with degree in home economics with a major in dietetics as professional human nutritionist eligible to teach dietetics and human nutrition.
- Include Home Economics with majors in nutrition in the accreditation scheme for professional nutritionists.
- Update the current HEC approved curriculum as it is not made by HND experts and has serious lacking as per international standards of dietetic education.
- Relevant subject experts must be involved in development and approval of the curriculum, in order to safeguard the future of professionals in Human Nutrition and Dietetics.

Anaffar 20/7/2022

21. Dr. Rubina Hakeem, on special invitation, participated (online) in the council board meeting and she emphasized to develop unified curriculum for HND and distinguish between food technologist and human nutritionist/dietitian. She also emphasized the evaluators panels must be from proper cadre and not merely food technologist.

**Decision:** Honorable members appreciated the concern and reiterated that HND and FST will be considered as separate entities for the accreditation with proper standards

# Agenda Item No. 10: Eligibility Criteria/Admission Requirements for Undergraduate Agriculture and Allied Degree Programs

22. Secretary briefed the honorable members that some agriculture DAIs have different eligibility criteria/admission requirements for undergraduate agriculture and allied degree programs. It is proposed that the minimum eligibility criteria and admission requirements for undergraduate agriculture and allied degree programs may be unified in all DAIs. Hence draft eligibility criteria and admission requirements for undergraduate degree programs were discussed in detail and approved as follows.

#### Eligibility Criteria

- Minimum 50% aggregate marks each in SSC and HSSC or equivalent exams (as per IBCC equivalence).
- Candidates of O/A Level or any other foreign equivalent qualification can apply on the basis of O Level (SSC) equivalence certificate obtained from IBCC office but confirmation of their admission is subject to provision of A Level (HSSC) equivalence certificate duly obtained from IBCC, Pakistan with minimum 50% marks.
- 23. Academic qualification needed for different programs is as follows:

Degree Programs	Academic Qualification	
Agricultural Biotechnology/Agricultural Chemistry/ Agricultural Economics/Agricultural Education and Extension/Agricultural Entomology/Agronomy/ Animal Science/ Climate Change/Climate Studies/ Crop Physiology/Dairy Sciences/Dairy Technology/ Environmental Science/Fisheries and Aqua Culture/ Food Science and Technology/Forestry and Range Management/Horticulture/ Marketing and Agribusiness/Plant Breeding and Genetics/Plant Pathology/ Plant Protection/ Poultry Science/Seed Science and Technology/ Soil Science/ Weed Science/Wildlife Management	<ol> <li>Intermediate Science (Pre-Medical/Pre- Engineering) with 50% marks</li> <li>Intermediate (Pre-Agriculture) with CGPA 2.20</li> <li>A level or any other foreign equivalent, qualification approved by IBCC having minimum 50% marks</li> </ol>	
Human Nutrition and Dietetics/ Nutritional Sciences/ Nutrition and Dietetics	<ul> <li>Above 1, 2, 3 and</li> <li>4) Intermediate Science (Pre-Medical and Home Economics), A-Level (Biology mandatory) or equivalent with 50% marks</li> </ul>	

Ahaffar 20/7/2022

#### Decision: Honorable members agreed the admission criteria as proposed.

### Agenda Item No. 11: Registration of Students from Non-Accredited HEIs

24. Secretary apprised the honorable members of council board that under the guidance of board, the registration of students related to agriculture and allied disciplines has been initiated. Now guidance from honorable members is requested to differentiate between accredited and non-accredited institutions. After thorough discussion it was agreed that registration of agriculture graduates will be continued and to differentiate between substandard categories Y & Z the word "non-accredited" and for newly registered programs the word "not yet accredited" will be printed on the cards.

**Decision:** Honorable members agreed to award registration numbers to the students of nonaccredited HEIs with the suggestion that there must be a differentiation between accredited and non-accredited institutions by writing "non-accredited" for Y & Z and "not yet accredited" for newly registered programs on the registration card.

#### Agenda Item No. 12: Parent and Student Alert

25. Secretary informed the honorable members that as per decision of 14<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> council meetings, 8 new emerging disciplines of agriculture and allied sciences were added under scope of NAEAC. According to NAEAC bylaws under clause 8 (b) "Accreditation shall be a mandatory process for all relevant academic programs offered by public and private sector institutions. The incentive for obtaining such accreditation shall be enhanced recognition in the agriculture community and prospective students." Accordingly council initiated accreditation process of these disciplines in different HEIs across Pakistan. Some HEIs responded and accreditation related activities started through mutual consent but some DAIs are reluctant/unresponsive. For this purpose a parent and student alert is prepared for publishing in print and digital media and placed under **Annexure-II**.

#### Decision: Agenda item was approved unanimously as proposed.

# <u>Current Work Agenda Item No.1:</u> Dedicated Internship (preferably paid) in 8<sup>th</sup> Semester of Undergraduate Degree Programs in agriculture and allied disciplines

26. Chairperson highlighted importance of paid internship (in 8<sup>th</sup> semester) in agriculture and allied disciplines where hands on training has its significance for development of skills in the graduates. Therefore since the creation of HEC internship program was mandated for professional degree programs. However, in 2014 while NCRC meetings were convened and the contributors from Sindh, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan requested to transfer the internship as optional feature due to law and order situation in their provinces. By the grace of Allah now the law and order situation have been improved. Accordingly so many progressive institutions have already mandated the internship again for the completion of degree program.

Achaffar 20/7/2022

27. After thorough discussion honorable members, keeping in view the importance of internship, unanimously decided to re-implement the internship (preferably paid) in 8<sup>th</sup> semester to complete the professional degree in all agriculture and allied disciplines in the country.

### Decision: Agenda item was approved as proposed unanimously.

# <u>Current Work Agenda Item No.2:</u> Creation of Post Assistant Director (Registration) (BPS-17)

28. Chairperson apprised the council members that NAEAC Board has mandated council to register currently enrolled students in all agriculture and allied disciplines including the new emerging disciplines like HND, Poultry Science and Environmental Sciences etc. The current manpower has specific assignments and it seems difficult to undertake the registration of students and card preparation assignments with the existing manpower. Therefore, honorable members are requested to allow creation of Assistant Director Registration post for undertaking registration along with other activities simultaneously.

# **Decision:** The honorable members approved the creation of one post of Assistant Director (BPS-17) (Registration).

29. At the end the Chairperson thanked all the members for participation and emphasized that the decisions taken in the council board meeting will lead in improving education system over the years.



List of Participants of 18th Council Meeting held on March 25, 2022

- 1. Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq Ahmad Rajwana, Chairperson NAEAC
- 2. Prof. Dr. Fauzia Yusuf Hafeez, Vice Chairperson NAEAC
- 3. Prof. Dr. Aman Ullah Malik, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad
- 4. Prof. Dr. Ahmad-Ur-Rahman Saljoqi, Dean, Faculty of Crop Protection Sciences, UAP
- 5. Prof. Dr. Fayyaz ul Hassan, Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Science, PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi
- 6. Prof. Dr. Qamaruddin Chachar, Dean, Faculty of Crop Production, SAU, Tandojam
- 7. Prof. Dr. Shafqat Saeed, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture & Environmental Sciences, MNSUA, Multan
- 8. Dr. Tamoor Khan, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture, LUAWMS, Uthal
- 9. Prof. Muhammad Aslam Niazi, Principal, Balochistan Agriculture College, Quetta
- **10. Mr. Muhammad Nawaz Khan,** Director General, Ayub Agriculture Research Institute, Faisalabad
- 11. Dr. Muhammad Javed, Director General, Agriculture Research Institute, Baluchistan
- 12. Dr. Muhammad Anjum Ali, Director General Agriculture (Extension & AR), Agriculture Department, Punjab
- **13. Mr. Malik Nasir,** Director Planning, Agriculture Extension, Agriculture Livestock Fisheries & Cooperative Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- 14. Ms. Nighat Jawwad, C.E.O, Food Tech Solutions YUMZ (PK), Lahore
- 15. Mr. Faisal Shahid, Managing Director, Faisal Group of Industries, Multan
- 16. Mr. Noor Muhammad Baloch, Director General, Agriculture Research Sindh, Tandojam
- **17. Mr. Allah Warayo Rind,** Additional Director General, Planning of Monitoring Cell, Agriculture Supply and Prices Department, Sindh

#### Proxy:

- 1. Miss Sana Khaliq, PSO/Registrar, PIASA, NARC, Islamabad
- 2. Dr. Muhammad Musa, Director General, Agriculture Research Institute Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
- 3. Ms. Humaira Quddus, Director/In-Charge, QAA, HEC, Islamabad

#### Apologies:

- 1. Mr. Khawaja Muhammad Mohsin Masood, Director, Mahmood Group of Industries, Kabirwala
- 2. Dr. Sayed Zaheer Hussain, Joint Scientific Adviser, Ministry of Science and Technology, Islamabad.
- 3. Mr. Asif Majeed, President, Evyol Group of Companies, Multan

#### NAEAC Secretariat Staff:

- 1. Dr. Abdul Ghaffar, Secretary
- 2. Mr. Abdullah, IT Coordinator
- 3. Mr. Kausar Saeed Awan, Deputy Director, Coordination
- 4. Mr. Malik Arshad, Assistant Director, Admin & Finance(online)
- 5. Mr. Muhammad Faraz Afzal, Assistant Director Coordination
- 6. Mr. Zafar Ali, Software Engineer/Web Developer
- 7. Mr. Muhammad Shafqat, Dispatch Rider

Chaffar 20/7/2022

